



Characterization of the development stages and roles of nutrients and other environmental factors in green tides in the Southern Yellow Sea, China

Haibo Zhang^{a,c}, Guoshan Wang^b, Chuansong Zhang^{a,c}, Rongguo Su^{a,c,*}, Xiaoyong Shi^{b,c,*},
Xiulin Wang^{a,c}

^a Key Laboratory of Marine Chemistry Theory and Technology, Ministry of Education, Ocean University of China, Qingdao, 266100, China

^b National Marine Hazard Mitigation Service, Beijing, 100194, China

^c College of Chemistry and Chemical Engineering, Ocean University of China, Qingdao, 266100, China

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Eutrophication
Green tide
Logistic growth curve
Nutrients
Precipitation
Ulva prolifera

ABSTRACT

Large-scale floating green tides in the Southern Yellow Sea (SYS) caused by the macroalgal species *Ulva prolifera* have been recurring for 13 years and have become one of the greatest marine ecological disasters in the world. In this study, we attempt to explore the development pattern of green tides and find its key environmental influencing factors. The satellite remote sensing data of the development process of green tides fit the logistic growth curve ($R^2 = 0.93$, $P < 0.01$) well, showing three distinct growth phases (lag, exponential growth, and short plateau phases). Correspondingly, the green tide-drifting area from the coast of Jiangsu to the nearshore waters of the Shandong Peninsula was divided into three sections: the lag phase zone (A), the exponential growth phase zone (B), and the plateau phase zone (C). Zone A in the south of Jiangsu coastal waters had abundant inorganic nutrients that were indispensable to the green tide initiation. Zone B was mainly located out of Haizhou Bay, south of 34.5° N and north of 35.5° N, where approximately 80% of the green tide biomass was generated. The rich bioavailable nutrient sources, suitable temperature, and irradiance in this area were the main promotion factors for the rapid growth and scale expansion of green tides. Wet precipitation in zone B in May and June also played an important role in the final scale of green tides. Zone C had poor nutrients, increasing temperature, and irradiance (high transparency), which limited the continued expansion of green tides, and organic nutrients might be an important support to green tides development in this region. The study based on the growth phases of green tides could help us further understand the eutrophication mechanism in the green tide outbreaks in SYS.

1. Introduction

Green tides caused by macroalgae *Ulva*, *Enteromorpha*, *Chaetomorpha*, *Cladophora*, and *Ulvaria* species had become a worldwide environmental phenomenon in some eutrophic coastal and gulf areas (Bermejo et al., 2019; Charlier et al., 2008; Fletcher, 1996; Hiraoka et al., 2010; Nelson et al., 2008; Victor and Adriana, 2013; Yabe et al., 2009; Ye et al., 2011; Zhao et al., 2018a). The large amount of macroalgal biomass could rapidly absorb nutrients and release allelochemicals that limit the growth of other plankton (Tang and Gobler, 2011), change the ecosystem structure, and decrease biodiversity (Gladyshev and Gubelit, 2019; Lotze and Worm, 2000; Lyons et al., 2014). In addition, the floating green tide patches would affect the sunlight reaching the deep layers, which would result in primary production decline (Lyons et al., 2014; Sun et al., 2018). The seagrass beds would degenerate and reduce the yields of marine

products (Miao et al., 2018). When algae accumulate, sink, and die on shore or sea, the decomposition of macroalgae would consume the dissolved oxygen, cause a local hypoxia or oxygen-depleted zones (Nörkko and Bonsdorff, 1996), and release a large amount of sulfur compounds; such release would not only damage the production of coastal mariculture (Le Luherne et al., 2016; Paumier et al., 2018) but also prevent people from using the waterfront area covered by macroalgae, which in turn would influence the development of tourism economy in coastal cities (Nelson et al., 2008).

In the Southern Yellow Sea (SYS) in China, large-scale free-floating green tides formed by the macroalgae species *Ulva prolifera* had been recurring for 13 years since 2007 (Keesing et al., 2011; Liu et al., 2009; Zhao et al., 2018a). Previous cruise field surveys showed that the small scatter patches of green tide algae (including several *U.* species) (Duan et al., 2012; Fan et al., 2015; Song et al., 2015; Wang et al., 2018) were first observed along the *Porphyra* agriculture area of

* Corresponding author.

E-mail addresses: surongguo@ouc.edu.cn (R. Su), shixy@ouc.edu.cn (X. Shi).

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hal.2020.101893>

Received 19 March 2020; Received in revised form 12 August 2020; Accepted 15 August 2020

Available online 24 August 2020

1568-9883/ © 2020 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

factors contributed to the different growth phases and development characteristics. The results could be helpful in further understanding the outbreak mechanisms of green tides in the SYS.

Declaration of Competing Interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Acknowledgements

We thank the associate editor and reviewers for their valuable and constructive comments. This study was financially supported by the China National Key Research and Development Program (No. 2016YFC1402101), the Joint Fund between NSFC and Shandong Province (No. U1906210), the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (No. 201961011).

Supplementary materials

Supplementary material associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at doi:10.1016/j.hal.2020.101893.

References

- Ahmedabadi, P.M., Kain, V., 2019. Modelling transformation kinetics of different solid-state reactions using sigmoidal model. *Materialia* 5, 100235. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matla.2019.100235>.
- Lin, Apeng, Shen, Songdong, Wang, Jianwei, Yan, Binlun, 2008. Reproduction Diversity of *Enteromorpha prolifera*. *J. Integr. Plant Biol.* 5 (50), 622–629 DOI: CNKI:SUN:ZWXB.0.2008-05-015.
- Arenas, A.R., Thacker, N.B., Haskell, E.C., 2017. The logistic growth model as an approximating model for viral load measurements of influenza A virus. *Math. Comput. Simulat.* 133, 206–222. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matcom.2016.10.002>.
- Bao, M., Guan, W., Yang, Y., Cao, Z., Qi, C., 2015. Drifting trajectories of green algae in the western Yellow Sea during the spring and summer of 2012. *Estuar. Coast. Shelf. S.* 163, 9–16. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eess.2015.02.009>.
- Bernejo, R., Heesch, S., Mac Monagail, M., O'Donnell, M., Daly, E., Wilkes, R.J., Morrison, L., 2019. Spatial and temporal variability of biomass and composition of green tides in Ireland. *Harmful Algae* 81, 94–105. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hal.2018.11.015>.
- Buchanan, R.L., Whiting, R.C., Damert, W.C., 1997. When is simple good enough: a comparison of the Gompertz, Baranyi, and three-phase linear models for fitting bacterial growth curves. *Food Microbiol.* 14 (4), 313–326. <https://doi.org/10.1006/fmic.1997.0125>.
- CFSYB, 1999. China Fishery Statistical Year Book. China Agriculture Press. <https://navi.cnki.net/knavi/YearbookDetail?pcode=CYFD&pykm=YZYTN> (in Chinese).
- Charlier, R.H., Morand, P., Fink, C.W., Thys, A.C., 2008. Green Tides on the Brittany Coasts. *Us/au Bah. Int. Symp.*
- Christopher, E.N., Cheryl, A.B., Daniel, R.L., 2001. Seasonal mean circulation in the Yellow Sea — a model-generated climatology. *Cont. Shelf. Res.* 21 (6), 667–695. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0278-4343\(00\)00102-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0278-4343(00)00102-3).
- Cohen, S.A., Strydom, D.J., 1988. Amino acid analysis utilizing phenylisothiocyanate derivatives. *Anal. Biochem.* 174 (1), 1–16. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0003-2697\(88\)90512-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/0003-2697(88)90512-X).
- Cui, J., Shi, J., Zhang, J., Wang, L., Fan, S., Xu, Z., Huo, Y., Zhou, Q., Lu, Y., He, P., 2018. Rapid expansion of *Ulva* blooms in the Yellow Sea, China through sexual reproduction and vegetative growth. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.* 130, 223–228. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2018.03.036>.
- Ding, Y., 2014. Impacts of *Ulva* (*Enteromorpha*) *prolifera* in the green tide on the Yellow Sea ecological environment—Implications from migration and transformation of biogenic elements Institute of Oceanology. Univ. China. Acad. Sci., Qingdao (in Chinese, with English abstract).
- Duan, W., Guo, L., Sun, D., Zhu, S., Chen, X., Zhu, W., Xu, T., Chen, C., 2012. Morphological and molecular characterization of free-floating and attached green macroalgae *Ulva* spp. in the Yellow Sea of China. *J. Appl. Phycol.* 24 (1), 97–108. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10811-011-9654-7>.
- Fan, S., Fu, M., Wang, Z., Zhang, X., Song, W., Li, Y., Liu, G., Shi, X., Wang, X., Zhu, M., 2015. Temporal variation of green macroalgal assemblage on Porphyra aquaculture rafts in the Subei Shoal, China. *Estuar. Coast. Shelf. S.* 163, 23–28. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eess.2015.03.016>.
- Fletcher, R.L., 1996. The Occurrence of “Green Tides”—a Review. In: Schramm, W., Nienhuis, P.H. (Eds.), *Marine Benthic Vegetation. Ecological Studies (Analysis and Synthesis)* 123 Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg.
- Fu, M., Sun, P., Wang, Z., Wei, Q., Qu, P., Zhang, X., Li, Y., 2018. Structure, characteristics and possible formation mechanisms of the subsurface chlorophyll maximum in the Yellow Sea Cold Water Mass. *Cont. Shelf. Res.* 165, 93–105. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.csr.2018.07.007>.
- Fujikawa, H., Kai, A., Morozumi, S., 2004. A new logistic model for *Escherichia coli* growth at constant and dynamic temperatures. *Food Microbiol.* 21 (5), 501–509. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2004.01.007>.
- Gao, S., Chen, X., Yi, Q., Wang, G., Pan, G., Lin, A., Peng, G., 2010. A strategy for the proliferation of *Ulva prolifera*, main causative species of green tides, with formation of sporangia by fragmentation. *PLoS One* 5, e8571. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0008571>.
- Gao, S., Waller, P., Khawan, G., Attalah, S., Huesemann, M., Ogden, K., 2018. Incorporation of salinity, nitrogen, and shading stress factors into the Huesemann Algae Biomass Growth model. *Algal Res.* 35, 462–470. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.algal.2018.09.021>.
- Geng, H., Yu, R., Zhng, Q., Yan, T., Kong, F., Zhou, M., 2019. Tracing the settlement region of massive floating green algae in the Yellow Sea. *J. Oceanol. Limnol.* 37 (5), 1555–1565. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00343-019-8348-x>.
- Gladyshev, M.I., Gubelit, Y.I., 2019. Green Tides: New Consequences of the Eutrophication of Natural Waters (Invited Review). *Contemp. Probl. Ecol.* 12 (2), 109–125. <https://doi.org/10.1134/S1995-425519020057>.
- Godoy, C.A., Monterubbianesi, G., Sanchez, E., Tognetti, J.A., 2018. Cluster illumination differentially affects growth of fruits along their ontogeny in highbush blueberry (*Vaccinium corymbosum* L.). *Sci. Horticul.* 230, 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scienta.2017.11.008>.
- Grasshoff, K., Kremling, K., Ehrhardt, M., 2007. *Methods of Seawater Analysis*. Third Ed. He, Y., Ao, Y., Yin, Y., Yuan, A., Che, T., Li, L., Shen, S., 2019. Comparative transcriptome analysis between floating and attached *Ulva prolifera* in studying green tides in the Yellow Sea. *Algal Res.* 44, 101712. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.algal.2019.101712>.
- †, M.U.Hiraoka, M., Shimada, S., Masuda, M., 2010. A new green-tide-forming alga, *Ulva ohnoi* Hiraoka et Shimada sp. nov. (*Ulvales*, *Ulvophyceae*) from Japan. *Phycol. Res.* 52 (1), 17–29. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1440-1835.2003.00321.x>.
- Hohenegger, J., 2018. Foraminiferal growth and test development. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* 185, 140–162. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earsci.2018.06.001>.
- JPEB, 2003. Jiangsu Province Environmental Bulletin. Department of Ecology and Environment of Jiangsu Province. <http://hbt.jiangsu.gov.cn/col/col1656/index.htm> (in Chinese).
- Keesing, J.K., Liu, D., Fearn, P., Garcia, R., 2011. Inter- and intra-annual patterns of *Ulva prolifera* green tides in the Yellow Sea during 2007–2009, their origin and relationship to the expansion of coastal seaweed aquaculture in China. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.* 62 (6), 1169–1182. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2011.03.040>.
- Keesing, J.K., Liu, D., Shi, Y., Wang, Y., 2016. Abiotic factors influencing biomass accumulation of green tide causing *Ulva* spp. on *Pyropia* culture rafts in the Yellow Sea. *China. Mar. Pollut. Bull.* 105 (1), 88–97. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2016.02.051>.
- Kim, J.-H., Kang, E.J., Park, M.G., Lee, B.-G., Kim, K.Y., 2010. Effects of temperature and irradiance on photosynthesis and growth of a green-tide-forming species (*Ulva linza*) in the Yellow Sea. *J. Appl. Phycol.* 23 (3), 421–432. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10811-010-9590-y>.
- Kong, F., Mao, Y., Cui, F., Zhang, X., Gao, Z., 2011. Morphology and molecular identification of *Ulva* forming green Tides in Qingdao, China. *J. Ocean. U. China.* 10 (1), 73–79. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11802-011-1738-2>.
- Koroleff, F., 1970. Direct determination of ammonia in natural waters as indophenol blue. Information on techniques and methods for sea water analysis. *ICES J. Mar. Sci.* 114, 799–801.
- Lü, X., Qiao, F., Xia, C., Wang, G., Yuan, Y., 2010. Upwelling and surface cold patches in the Yellow Sea in summer: Effects of tidal mixing on the vertical circulation. *Cont. Shelf. Res.* 30 (6), 620–632. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.csr.2009.09.002>.
- Le Luherne, E., Réveillac, E., Ponsero, A., Sturbis, A., Ballu, S., Perdriau, M., Le Pape, O., 2016. Fish community responses to green tides in shallow estuarine and coastal areas. *Estuar. Coast. Shelf. S.* 175, 79–92. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eess.2016.03.031>.
- Li, D., Gao, Z., Song, D., Shang, W., Jiang, X., 2019a. Characteristics and influence of green tide drift and dissipation in Shandong Rongcheng coastal water based on remote sensing. *Estuar. Coast. Shelf. S.* 227, 106335. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eess.2019.106335>.
- Li, H., Tang, H., Shi, X., Zhang, C., Wang, X., 2014. Increased nutrient loads from the Changjiang (Yangtze) River have led to increased Harmful Algal Blooms. *Harmful Algae* 39 (39), 92–101. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hal.2014.07.002>.
- Li, H., Zhang, C., Han, X., Shi, X., 2015. Changes in concentrations of oxygen, dissolved nitrogen, phosphate, and silicate in the southern Yellow Sea, 1980–2012: Sources and seaward gradients. *Estuar. Coast. Shelf. S.* 163, 44–55. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eess.2014.12.013>.
- Li, H., Zhang, Y., Chen, J., Zheng, X., Liu, F., Jiao, N., 2018. Nitrogen uptake and assimilation preferences of the main green tide alga *Ulva prolifera* in the Yellow Sea. *China. J. Appl. Phycol.* 31 (1), 625–635. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10811-018-1575-2>.
- Li, H., Zhang, Y., Han, X., Shi, X., Rivkin, R.B., Legendre, L., 2016. Growth responses of *Ulva prolifera* to inorganic and organic nutrients: Implications for macroalgal blooms in the southern Yellow Sea. *China. Sci Rep-UK.* 6, 26498. <https://doi.org/10.1038/srep26498>.
- Li, H., Zhang, Y., Tang, H., Shi, X., Rivkin, R.B., Legendre, L., 2017. Spatiotemporal variations of inorganic nutrients along the Jiangsu coast, China, and the occurrence of macroalgal blooms (green tides) in the southern Yellow Sea. *Harmful Algae* 63, 164–172. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hal.2017.02.006>.
- Li, Y., Zheng, M., Lin, J., Zhou, S., Sun, T., Xu, N., 2019b. Darkness and low nighttime temperature modulate the growth and photosynthetic performance of *Ulva prolifera* under lower salinity. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.* 146, 85–91. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2019.05.058>.